



P.O. Box 5006
Fremont, CA 94537-5006

Environmental Sustainability Commission Special Meeting Agenda and Report – January 21, 2021

General Order of Business

1. Call to Order - 5:00 p.m.
2. Roll Call
3. Written and Oral Communications
4. Approval of Minutes/Agenda Review
5. Staff Presentations and Action Items
6. Adjournment

IMPORTANT NOTICE REGARDING THE ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION MEETING

Pursuant to State of California Executive Order N-29-20 dated March 17, 2020, regarding the COVID-19 pandemic, the City offices will not be open for the January 21, 2021 meeting of the Environmental Sustainability Commission. The meeting will be conducted remotely via video/teleconference.

The Public may watch and/or participate in the public meeting by joining the meeting through the Zoom Videoconference link provided below. The public may also join the meeting by calling the below listed teleconference phone number. Submission of Public Comments: For those wishing to make public comments at the January 21, 2021 Environmental Sustainability Commission meeting, you may either: (1) submit your comments by email prior to the meeting, or (2) by Spoken Public Comment during the meeting.

How to submit Public Communications/Public Comment by email prior to the meeting:

Send an email to rdifranco@fremont.gov by 10:00 a.m. the day of the meeting. Please identify the agenda item number and meeting date in the subject line of your email, or specify that it is not related to an agenda item. Emails will be compiled into files by agenda item number, distributed to the Environmental Sustainability Commission and staff, and published in the City's Agenda Center on www.fremont.gov. Electronic comments on agenda items for the meeting may only be submitted by email. Comments via text and social media (Facebook, Twitter, etc.) will not be accepted.

How to provide Spoken Public Comment during the meeting:

The meeting will begin at 5 p.m. Whether you participate online or by phone, you may wish to "arrive" early so that you can address any technology questions prior to the start of the meeting.

Agenda – Fremont Environmental Sustainability Commission Special Meeting

January 21, 2021

Your interest in the conduct of your City's business is appreciated.

How to provide Spoken Public Comment during the meeting (cont.):

- 1) By online: Environmental Sustainability Commission Zoom Webinar:
<https://zoom.us/j/3622337935>
 - a. Use a current, up-to-date browser: Chrome 30+, Firefox 27+, Microsoft Edge 12+, Safari 7+. Certain functionality may be disabled in older browsers including Internet Explorer. Mute all other audio before speaking. Using multiple devices can cause an audio feedback.
 - b. Enter an email address and name. The name will be visible online and will be used to notify you that it is your turn to speak.
 - c. When the Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, click on “Raise Hand.” Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak.
 - d. When called, please limit your remarks to the time limit allotted.
- 2) By phone: **1 (669) 900-9128; Webinar ID: 362 233 7935**
 - a. For anyone dialing into the call, please note that your phone number may be visible to the public.
 - b. Dial *9 to enable the “Raise Hand” feature via phone.

Order of Discussion

Generally, the order of discussion after introduction of an item by the Chair will include comments and information by staff followed by Environmental Sustainability Commission (ESC) questions or inquiries. An authorized representative or interested citizen may then speak on the item. At the close of public discussion, the item will be considered by the ESC and action taken.

Addressing the Environmental Sustainability Commission

Any person may speak on any item under discussion by the ESC after receiving recognition from the Chair. When addressing the ESC, please state your name and address. In order to insure all persons have the opportunity to speak, a time limit may be set by the Chair for each speaker. In the interest of time, please limit your comments to new material; do not repeat what a prior speaker has said.

Oral Communications

Any person desiring to speak on a matter, which is not scheduled on this agenda, may do so under the Oral Communications section. Please be aware provisions of the California Government Code Section 54954.2(b) prohibit the ESC from taking any immediate action on an item, which does not appear on the agenda, unless it meets stringent requirements. The Chair may limit the length of your presentation.

Information

For agenda copies or information about the City or items scheduled on the Agenda and Report refer to: Community Development Department, P.O. Box 5006, Fremont, CA 94537-5006, phone (510) 494-4557.

The City of Fremont is committed to providing reasonable accommodation for the public. Due to social distancing requirements, remote observation is highly encouraged. If you require accommodations, please call for assistance at 510-494-4557 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting.

Environmental Sustainability Commission:**City Staff**

Shreya Ramachandran, Student Commissioner
 Paul Kelley, Business Community
 John Rennels, Development/Construction Industry
 Richard Godfrey, Environmental Organization (Chair)
 Shiva Swaminathan, Public At Large
 Carolyn Obata, Public At Large
 Daniel O'Donnell, Public At Large (Vice Chair)
 Nate Ivy, FUSD Representative

Dan Schoenholz, Director,
 Community Development
 Rachel DiFranco, Sustainability Manager,
 Community Development
 Maria Salinas, Comm. Dev. Services Supervisor,
 Community Development
 Margaux Juta, Senior Office Specialist,
 Community Development

**AGENDA
 FREMONT ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY
 COMMISSION (ESC)
 SPECIAL MEETING
 January 21, 2021, 5:00 p.m.**

Virtual Meeting via Zoom Webinar

1. **Call to order** (*Chair Godfrey*)
2. **Roll call and introduction of staff** (5 min)
3. **Oral and written communications** (5 min)
4. **Approval of minutes** ([September 3, 2020](#)) and review of agenda (5 min)
5. **Scheduled Items**
 - 5.1 **Commission Consideration of Recommendation to City Council on Municipal Electricity Rate Plan options under East Bay Community Energy** (45 min)

BACKGROUND:

East Bay Community Energy (EBCE), a Joint Powers Authority (JPA) authorized by Fremont City Council in 2016, is Fremont's default local electricity generation provider. Since EBCE electrical service began in 2018, EBCE has offered three product options to its customers, as follows:

Product	Power Mix*	Carbon-Free Content	Cost
Renewable 100	100% Renewable	100%	Approx. 10% premium
Brilliant 100	100% Carbon-free	100%	Same as PG&E
Bright Choice	86% Carbon-Free	86%	1% discount

*Carbon-free content includes solar, wind, and large hydropower.

Renewable content in Renewable 100 includes California-produced wind and solar power.

When East Bay Community Energy (EBCE) launched service in 2018, Council chose Brilliant 100 (100% carbon free electricity) as the product for all municipal accounts, thus reducing the City’s carbon footprint from municipal operations without increasing utility costs compared to PG&E.

In 2020, EBCE staff notified their Board and municipal customers that Brilliant 100 was not generating enough revenues to cover its costs. After considerable discussion and a review of a variety of options, the EBCE Board voted in November 2020 to continue to offer Brilliant 100 at a subsidized rate maintaining price parity with PG&E through the 2021 calendar year. EBCE staff has informed member cities that as of January 1, 2022, the most likely scenario is that Brilliant 100 will be phased out as an option, and that municipal accounts will need to be enrolled in either Renewable 100 or Bright Choice at that time.

Because staff is in the process of developing the proposed FY 21-22 operating budget, and because the decision of which electricity plan to use for municipal accounts will have budget impacts in FY 21-22, staff is seeking direction from the ESC and from Council on whether to enroll in Renewable 100 or Bright Choice. Should EBCE offer additional options to municipalities before January 1, 2022, staff would return to the ESC and to Council to determine whether one of the newly available options would be preferable based on environmental and budgetary considerations.

DISCUSSION:

As of 2019, net electricity consumption for municipal operations was about 8.6 million kilowatt-hours. This represents a reduction of about 44% since 2015 (which was 15.4 million kilowatt-hours) thanks to significant energy efficiency upgrades (including replacement of all streetlights with LEDs) and installation of more than 1.6 MW of solar generation capacity at several City facilities.

With enrollment in Brilliant 100 in 2018, greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions associated with the remaining electrical load from municipal operations were eliminated. Carbon free electricity for City operations has contributed to the City achieving the goal in its 2012 Climate Action Plan of a 25% reduction in GHG emissions from 2005 levels by 2020. It is also consistent with the

Council’s adopted goal of net carbon neutrality for the entire community by 2045.

If the City were to select Renewable 100 as its new electricity product in 2022, municipal operations would continue to result in no net carbon emissions. Renewable 100 enrollment would also serve to grow the market for locally produced renewable power, as well as signaling continued City leadership in clean power procurement.

If the City were to select Bright Choice, City operations would have a carbon footprint of an estimated 527 metric tons. It should be noted that although Bright Choice does result in some carbon emissions, such emissions are still considerably lower than those associated with PG&E’s power mix. In addition, in December 2020, the EBCE Board resolved to commit EBCE to providing 100% clean power by the year 2030 or sooner.

FISCAL IMPACT:

Under the current Brilliant 100 rate plan, the City spends approximately \$716,000 per year in generation charges. If the City’s accounts are changed to Renewable 100, annual costs would increase by approximately \$87,000 to \$803,000. If the City’s accounts are changed to Bright Choice, annual costs would decrease by approximately \$7,200. These estimates are based on 2019 expenditures and do not account for annual increases that result from increases in PG&E and EBCE rates.

Approximate Annual Costs	
Current spending on City accounts enrolled in Brilliant 100	\$716,099
If City’s accounts are opted up to Renewable 100	\$803,077
If City’s accounts are defaulted down to Bright Choice	\$708,938

It should be noted that because of economic disruptions related to the COVID-19 pandemic, the City is projecting a significant budget deficit in FY 21-22. Any new expenditures not accounted for in the current budget forecast will increase the magnitude of this deficit.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the Environmental Sustainability Commission provide its recommendation to City Council on whether the City should default its municipal electricity accounts to the EBCE Bright Choice rate or to opt up to the Renewable 100 rate upon the anticipated phase out of the Brilliant 100 rate at the end of 2021.

6. **Adjourn**